

Butch Atwood and Cecil Smith Timeline

January 12, 2020

1 Explicitly States and Derived Facts From Evidentiary Materials

1.1 Accident Time (Derived)

- Just Prior to 7:27 PM “Mrs. Westman said she called 911 right away and had no trouble getting through” (APN) & Faith Westman called at 7:27 (Grafton County Sheriff’s Logs)
- Just Prior to 7:29 PM (Whitewash) “We heard a thump’ Faith Westman states, and she went to her kitchen window and saw a car parallel parked across the road with no lights on and called 9-1-1. Her call is received by Grafton County Dispatch approximately at 7:29 PM” (**Divergent**)

1.2 Faith Westman’s Call to Grafton County Dispatch

- 7:27 PM (New Hampshire Department of Justice Cold Case Unit Member Chuck West via Erinn Larkin) “According to Detective West, Faith Westman’s call came into Grafton County Dispatch at 7:27 PM and Butch Atwood’s call came into 911 at 7:42 PM.”
- 7:27 PM (Grafton County Sheriff’s Logs) "Narrative: 02/09/2004 1940 Marsh, Rhonda At 1927, FAITH WESTMAN CALLED, TO ADV OF A VEH IN THE DITCH RIGHT ON SHARP TURN AFTER THE WEATHERED BARN. UNK IF PI, BUT CAN SEE A MAN IN VEH SMOKING CIGARETTE, WAS E/B RT 112, BUT ENDED UP IN W/B DITCH FACING W/B."

1.3 Duration of Faith Westman’s Call to Grafton County Dispatch

- 1:18 (David Hilts, New Hampshire Department of Safety) “...the Westman call is approximately 1 minute 18 seconds.”

1.4 Cecil Smith's Dispatch Time

- 7:29:21PM (Grafton County Sheriff's Logs)
- 7:30 (Uniform Traffic Accident Report, Page 2)
- 7:35 (Uniform Traffic Accident Report, Page 1)

1.5 Cecil Smith's Enroute Time

- Enroute to the accident scene at 7:29:36PM (Grafton County Sheriff's Logs)

1.6 Butch Atwood Arrival Time at Saturn

- Just Prior to 7:31-7:32PM (APN) "The Westmans said that 4 to 5 minutes after the car crashed, they saw a school bus"
- Just Prior to 7:28-7:29 PM (Paradee) {Assumes from time of crash and treated as 1 to 2 minutes} "After the Westmans watched this car for a few minutes, Bruce Atwood, one of their neighbors, drove by and stopped at the collision scene."
- Just Prior to 7:28-7:29 PM {Unclear if 1 - 2 minutes is from start of 911 call or from time of crash} (Whitewash) "Atwood arrives with 1 - 2 min per Faith."
- 7:35 PM "Atwood arrived at 7:35 PM Maura was in the car, sitting there with no lights on" (NHLI-Atwood)
- Just Prior to 7:31 to 7:32 PM {Assumes from time of crash} "Within 4 to 5 mins, a bus came down route 112 from Woodsville" (McDonald-Marotte)

1.7 Butch Atwood's Duration of Time at Saturn Before Leaving

- From 7:31-7:32 PM until 7:32-7:34 PM {Treated as 1 to 2 minutes} (APN) "It seemed that the bus driver talked to her for no more than two minutes..."
- From 7:28-7:29 PM until 7:29-7:31 PM (Paradee) "The Westmans recalled that Atwood spoke to Maura for only 1-2 minutes."
- From 7:28-7:29PM until 7:29-7:31 PM (Whitewash) "Atwood is there 1-2 mins tops Faith says."
- 2 Minutes (<https://mauramurray.createaforum.com/evidence/newspaper-articles-57/?message=656>) "Based on his recollection... Atwood's conversation with Maura could only have lasted a few minutes."

1.8 Butch Atwood's Departure Time From Saturn

- 7:32-7:34 PM (APN)
- 7:29-7:31 PM (Paradee)
- 7:29-7:31 PM (Whitewash)

1.9 Maura's Actions After Butch Left the Saturn

- "After Atwood drove away, Faith Westman noticed the Saturn's interior lights switch on and off and witnessed a flurry of activity at the rear of the car, including a person standing at the trunk, according to private investigator John Smith, who spoke with the Westmans after the accident. (<https://mauramurray.createaforum.com/evidence/newspaper-articles-57/?message=462>)
- "While on the phone with Dispatch, Faith witnesses a school bus driven by one of her two neighbors that Drove for First Student Busing. Westman was unable to tell which of the Atwoods Where driving that night. Westman saw the school bus approach the car within minutes to her phoning 911. Westman claims the bus driver opened the door and spoke to a driver who was out of the car. The school bus driver remained on the bus and Faith states the conversation seemed to be 1-2 minutes in length. Westman notes that the car driver activated the four-way hazard lights. She saw the school bus leave and Westman noted the driver was at the trunk of the car, then returned to the vehicle inside and Westman saw the interior lights flashed on and off. (<https://mauramurray.createaforum.com/evidence/whitewash's-interview-write-up-part-1/>)

Note: This proves that Maura Did Not Go With Butch Atwood. The Grafton County Sheriff's Logs do not mention the fact that Faith Westman saw Butch Atwood arrive and leave.

1.10 Butch Atwood's Call Time to Hanover Dispatch

- 7:42 PM (New Hampshire Department of Justice Cold Case Unit Member Chuck West via Erinn Larkin) "According to Detective West, Faith Westman's call came into Grafton County Dispatch at 7:27 PM and Butch Atwood's call came into 911 at 7:42 PM."
- "Its a Single Female" (Butch Atwood 911 Transcript)
- After 7:43 PM {after Grafton County Dispatch's conversation with Hanover Dispatch was complete} (Grafton County Sheriff's Logs) "...THEY ADV ONE FEMALE. NO PI, BUT SHOOK UP. (CALLED THE ATWOOD RES. WOMAN ADV HER HUSBAND SAW THE .CRASH AND CAME HERE TO CALL, BUT NO IDEA WHERE THE FEMALE IS."

Note: Butch Atwood was unable to call the Grafton County dispatcher because all circuits were busy. Hanover has its own dispatchers and log system, and therefore, Hanover calls are not logged into Grafton County's system. The Hanover logs were acquired under the FOIA, but Butch Atwood's call was not logged. They are here: <https://mauramurray.createaforum.com/evidence/hanover-logs-and-written-information-directly-from-hanover-staff/>

1.11 Duration of Butch Atwood's Call to Hanover Dispatch

- 3 minutes, 7:42PM to 7:45PM (David Hilts, New Hampshire Department of Safety) "...the Atwood call is approximately 3 minutes..."

1.12 Hanover Dispatch's Call to Grafton County Dispatch

- 7:43 PM (Grafton County Sheriff's Logs) "Narrative: 02/09/2004 1948 Marsh, Rhonda AT 1943, HANOVER DISP CALLED TO ADV GOT A 911 CALL FOR US; 911 ADVISED ALL CIRCUITS BUSY: IS FOR 10-25, CALLER AT 2 WILD AMMONOOSUC RD, BUTCH ATWOOD RES, 747-3664.

1.13 Grafton County Dispatch's Call Back to the Atwood Residence

- After 7:43 PM {after Grafton County Dispatch's conversation with Hanover Dispatch was complete} (Grafton County Sheriff's Logs) "... (CALLED THE ATWOOD RES. WOMAN ADV HER HUSBAND SAW THE CRASH AND CAME HERE TO CALL, BUT NO IDEA WHERE THE FEMALE IS."

1.14 Grafton County Dispatch Radios Cecil Smith to Inform Him That He Is Looking For a Single Female

Note: This is the only explanation for why Cecil Smith did not ask "Where is the man smoking a cigarette?" as reported by the Westmans.

1.15 Cecil Smith's Arrival Time

1.15.1 Non Divergent Times

- 7:46:20 PM (Grafton County Sheriff's Logs)
- 7:45 (Uniform Traffic Accident Report, Page 1)

- 7:42 PM - 7:49PM (APN) “When I asked the Westmans about the timeline between that point and when police arrived, they said that it took 15 minutes for the police to arrive after the bus left. They felt sure that it could have been that long but no shorter than 10 minutes.”

1.15.2 Divergent Times

- 7:35 PM - 7:37 PM (Paradee) “The Westmans noted it was 5-6 minutes in time from when Atwood left in the school bus to the time the Haverhill police officer arrived on the scene.” **(Divergent to APN interview that is being summarized.)**
- Several minutes after 7:29 - 7:31 PM {Still on phone with 911 after Butch Atwood departure, and after lights off/on in car. Call length per logs is 1:18, yet by her own account 2 to 4 minutes had passed plus time for activity in car.} (Whitewash). “...still on phone with 911...” **(Call Length Divergence - ranging from 42 seconds to 2 minutes 42 seconds)**
- 7:28:18 PM {Assumes 7:27 PM call start time and 1:18 call length} “Westmans states they heard a car pull up and Faith checked out the kitchen window and states she sees a Haverhill Police Department cruiser and ends the call with 911.” & “See Smith nose to nose hangs up with 911.” (Whitewash). **(Call End Relative to Law Enforcement Arrival Divergence - 16 Minutes Prior to Official Time)**

Note: Witness A’s Latest Time at Site Would Be 7:38.

1.16 Cecil Smith Parks Vehicle and Turns on Spotlight To Look at Saturn

- “Cecil Smith: Um, as I approached the scene I, uh, there was a 90 degree corner, um, I came around the corner and there was a black vehicle in my lane, facing me. Um, I could see, uh, tire impressions from the, going from the road to [00:04:00] a group of trees and then back to the vehicle that was at final rest. Um. I activated my take-down lights, they’re like spotlights on your light bar, you can see everything in the area, and there was no one around the vehicle.” (Cecil Smith Transcript - [https://mauramurray.createaforum.com/evidence/full-transcript-of-cecil-smith-interview-\(oxygen\)-part-1/](https://mauramurray.createaforum.com/evidence/full-transcript-of-cecil-smith-interview-(oxygen)-part-1/))

1.17 Cecil Smith Walks to The Westman’s Home

- “Cecil Smith: So, uh, I went first to the first 911 caller, uh, Westman’s house.” (Cecil Smith Transcript - [https://mauramurray.createaforum.com/evidence/full-transcript-of-cecil-smith-interview-\(oxygen\)-part-1/](https://mauramurray.createaforum.com/evidence/full-transcript-of-cecil-smith-interview-(oxygen)-part-1/))

1.18 Cecil Smith Interviews The Westmans Asking "Where is the Girl?"

- "Cecil Smith: So, uh, I went first to the first 911 caller, uh, Westman's house. Said "Where's the girl?" He said "We don't know. N-nobody's been here so we don't know. We, we haven't seen anything, [00:04:30] n-nobody leave." (Cecil Smith Transcript - [https://mauramurray.createaforum.com/evidence/full-transcript-of-cecil-smith-interview-\(oxygen\)-part-1/](https://mauramurray.createaforum.com/evidence/full-transcript-of-cecil-smith-interview-(oxygen)-part-1/))
- "Murray's family said Smith told them he thought the driver of the Saturn was Murray's father, to whom the car was registered. Mysterious to them, though, is why Smith asked neighbors, the night of the crash, "Where is the girl?" (<https://mauramurray.createaforum.com/evidence/newspaper-articles-57/?message=690>)
- "as soon as Cecil Smith arrived at her door, Cecil Smith asked 'where is the girl?'" (From: <http://www.the107degree.com/single-post/2017/10/18/Smith-Driving-the-SUV-Witness-A-and-the-Timeline>)

Note: Grafton County Dispatch Could Only Know that the Driver Was a Female Rather Than a Male After They Were Informed At 7:42 PM.

1.19 Cecil Smith Walks From The Westmans To His Car, Drives His Car to Butch's Bus

- "Cecil Smith: I went and talked to Mr. Atwood. He said "I just talked to her a couple minutes ago. She's right there at the car." I said "No, she's not there." Uh. He described her for me, he said "It's a pretty young lady, uh, shoulder-length brown hair. She was the only one I saw." Uh. I said "Was she, did she look like she was hurt, 'cause the wh-when I made a quick, uh, check of the vehicle both airbags were deployed and there was [00:05:00] a crack on the windshield, driver's side." He said "Nah. She looked shaken up but she didn't look hurt, but I think she'd been drinking because she slurred her speech and, uh, she had to lean on somethin' while she was standin' there." Uh, he said "I asked her if she wanted me to call the police. 'Nope. No. Please don't call the police.'" And, uh, as soon as he left there he went and apparently made another 911 call, which, uh, for some reason went through the Hanover [00:05:30] dispatch and took a lot longer to get back to me then, uh, what it normally would've taken. So that's what I saw when I first go there. And the vehicle was locked."

1.20 GRAFTON COUNTY DISPATCH'S CALL BACK TO THE WESTMAN RESIDENCE

- Grafton County called the Westmans back no earlier than 7:36 (when Butch was home, see McDonald interview) and no later than 7:40 (when the narrative about the Westmans' call was added to the log). Faith Westman told the dispatcher that she had seen a man in the passenger seat smoking a cigarette, she heard a car arrive, saw Smith nose-to-nose, and hung up with 911 (see White Wash interview).

1.21 Cecil Smith Interviews Butch Atwood

- "Sgt. Smith then drove the 200 yards east to Butch Atwood's home, and found Atwood sitting in his bus. Sgt. Smith knocked on the bus window. "He asked where the girl was," Atwood recalled and told the officer he hadn't seen anyone since leaving Maura's vehicle." (From: <https://mauramurray.createaforum.com/ev-articles-57/?message=657>)

1.22 Cecil Smith Issues Be On The Lookout

- 7:54 PM (Grafton County Sheriff's Logs)

1.23 Cecil Smith's Reported Tow Time To Lavoie's

- 8:50 PM (Grafton County Sheriff's Logs)

1.24 Cecil Smith's Cleared From Scene Time

- Cleared from the accident scene at 9:26:16 PM (Grafton County Sheriff's Logs)

2 Summarized Butch Atwood Time Line

Butch Atwood's time could be calculated as follows, from his arrival time at the accident site between 7:28 and 7:32

- 1 to 2 minutes to talk to Maura Murray, that would make it between 7:29 and 7:33
- 30 seconds to 1 minute to drive his bus to his driveway, that would make it between 7:29:30, 7:30 and 7:34
- 1 minute, 30 seconds to park his bus backwards in his driveway, that would make it between 7:31, 7:31:30 and 7:35:30
- 30 seconds to walk to his front door, that would make it between 7:31:30, 7:32 and 7:36
- 2 minutes to walk into the residence, get his telephone and walk outside to his front porch, that would make it between 7:33:30, 7:34 and 7:38
- 15 seconds to call 911, that would make it between 7:33:45, 7:34:15 and 7:38:15
- 15 seconds to receive a delay for busy circuits, that would make it between 7:34, 7:34:30 and 7:38:30
- 2 minutes to find the phone number for Hanover dispatch, that would make it between 7:36, 7:36:30 and 7:40:30
- 30 Seconds to call Hanover dispatch, that would make it between 7:36:30 7:37 and 7:41
- 3 minutes to talk to Hanover dispatch and hang up phone, that would make it between 7:39:30, 7:40 and 7:44 (logs say 7:43, so we use 7:43)
- 7 - 9 minutes to wait for Cecil Smith to arrive, that would make it between 7:50 and 7:52

A newspaper article in which Butch Atwood is interviewed is here:
<https://mauramurray.createaforum.com/evidence/newspaper-articles-57/?message=422>

3 Summarized Cecil Smith Timeline After Arriving at Accident Site

Cecil Smith's time line could be calculated as follows, if he arrived at the accident site at 7:46:20, it would take:

- 30 seconds to exit his car and approach the vehicle, that would make it 7:46:50.
- 1 minute to walk up to the Saturn and perceive that the Saturn's driver was not in the vehicle, that the airbags were deployed and that the windshield had a spider crack in it, that would make it 7:47:50. This is consistent with Cecil Smith's statement that he made a "quick check of the vehicle."

- 50 seconds to approach the Westman's front door, that would make it 7:48:40. (Art said this would take 50 seconds.)
- 1 minute, 30 seconds to converse with the Westmans briefly asking "where's the girl?" and having the Westmans tell him that they had seen one of the Atwoods stop to check if the driver was OK, that they could not tell whether the driver was male or female, and that they saw the driver turn the four-ways on and was moving about the interior of the car, that would make it 7:50:10. Cecil Smith could only ask where a girl was if he was informed a woman was in an accident.
- 50 seconds to return to his car, that would make it 7:51. (Art said this would take 50 seconds.)
- 30 seconds to 1 minute to drive to Butch Atwood's bus, he would be at the Bus talking to Butch Atwood between 7:51:30 and 7:52. This reconciles with Butch Atwood's statement that "After about seven to nine minutes, he looked out and saw the Haverhill Police" - as his call with Hanver ended at 7:43. (See above)
- 1 minute to converse with Butch Atwood, that would make it between 7:52:30 and 7:53. This is consistent with Cecil Smith's statement that "I didn't speak to him (Butch Atwood) very long I just probably less than a minute."
- 1 minute to issue a be on the lookout to the dispatcher, that would make it between 7:53:30 and 7:54. 7:54 reconciles with the "be on the lookout" time in the Grafton County Sheriff's Logs.
- 2 minutes, 30 seconds to check for footprints on the side of the road, that would make it between 7:56 and 7:56:30
- 30 seconds to 1 minute to return to the accident site. That would make it between 7:56:30, 7:57 and 7:57:30. This time range is after the time Dick Guy arrived (7:56:08). 7:56:30 reconciles with Dick Guy's statement: "We were dispatched to that call. We drove out. There's a car that apparently impacted a tree and it had spun around such that it was facing the opposite direction. We drove around it and parked. There was nobody at the site of the accident. It's not terribly unusual to have a car with nobody there. If somebody is driving impaired sometimes they don't really want to interact with the police."

Note: At 7:43 - 3 minutes prior to Cecil Smith's arrival, Rhonda Marsh informed Officer Smith that he was looking for a female driver. (See above.)

4 On Dispatchers Having Time To Respond

- It is noteworthy that Anthony Stiles, not Rhonda Marsh, logged Cecil Smith's arrival at the accident site as at 7:46:20. Rhonda Marsh was presumably preoccupied until 7:48 talking to Butch Atwood's wife [in second Atwood call], and therefore, unable to log in Cecil Smith's arrival at 7:46:20. After Hanover dispatch called dispatcher Rhonda Marsh at 7:43, Rhonda Marsh (Grafton) called the Atwood residence back. Rhonda Marsh reached Butch Atwood's wife, who was inside and able to get the phone. Butch Atwood was outside in his bus doing paperwork, and no longer had a phone available to him. Note that Butch Atwood's wife was on the phone with dispatcher Rhonda Marsh until 7:48, the time dispatcher Rhonda Marsh finished writing her narrative (about the Hanover call and the Atwood residence call back) into the dispatch system. Rhonda Marsh's call back to the Atwood Residence took place between [7:43 + time of Hanover call] and 7:48.

4.1 Dick Guy

- Although Dick Guy said "there was nobody at the site of the accident" when he arrived, it should be noted that he arrived after Cecil Smith was at the area of the accident scene at 7:46:20. Therefore, it is clear that Dick Guy was saying that Cecil Smith was not at the situs of the Saturn at 7:56 when he arrived with the EMS. Instead, he must have meant that Cecil Smith was not at the situs (or immediate vicinity) of the Saturn, as Cecil Smith was 100 yards up the road talking to Butch Atwood. He could not have meant that Cecil Smith was not in the general area of at the accident scene.

4.2 Anthony Stiles

- Anthony Stiles was busy handling multiple dispatches to a medical emergency at Littleton. Multiple Log entries took place at 7:19, 7:22, 7:23, 7:27, 7:28, 7:29 and 7:36 (almost 7:37). Single calls for Littleton took place at 7:43 and 7:46.
- Stiles was generally available to handle radio calls from Cecil Smith from 7:36 forward. This contradicts the idea that Cecil Smith's arrival time was entered into the system late because the dispatchers were preoccupied with other calls. And the evidence shows that even though Stiles had made an EMS entry for Littleton at 7:46:29, he managed to enter Cecil Smith's arrival at Haverhill at 7:46:20.
- Anthony Stiles dispatched fire and EMS to the Haverhill accident scene at 7:42 and logged in their arrivals at 7:45.

- Clearly, Anthony Stiles was preoccupied and could not dispatch Fire and EMS to Haverhill until after 7:29 and arguably not until after 7:36. Rhonda Marsh handled a call from Grafton at 7:36 that had to end before 7:43, but could have lasted up to a minute. However, Stiles did not dispatch Fire and EMS until 7:42.

4.3 Cecil Smith and EMS Dispatch

- So the question is why wasn't fire and EMS dispatched at 7:36? What took place between 7:37 and 7:42?
- It has been suggested that the delay from 7:37 to 7:42 in calling out fire and EMS is indicative that Cecil Smith was actually at the scene as early as 7:42, Cecil Smith having authority to do so.
- A source has been cited in support of this argument: John Healy, the former head of the NHLI a group that investigated Maura Murray's disappearance. It is clear, that John Healy has stated in a Crimewire interview, that Cecil Smith was the person that requested Fire and EMS.
- Although the evidence seems to indicate that Cecil Smith did not request fire and EMS come to the scene, we can still suppose that Cecil Smith did. And if we do, we will still note that Fire and EMS were not called from 7:35 - 7:41.
- If we give Cecil Smith 2 minutes from his arrival to determine that there was a spider crack in the window and airbags deployed and therefore, he should dispatch Fire and EMS, that would place his arrival at 7:40, at earliest. So even though this argument has been made, it does not support the theory that Cecil Smith was at the accident scene at 7:35. At best it might demonstrate some delay between actual events and how they are logged into the system. However it falls short of showing that Cecil Smith was there prior to Witness A's departure from the accident scene. Witness A could not have been at the scene any later than 7:39, and if she was there that late, she would have traveled an average of 50 miles an hour to Beaver Pond on a dark and dangerous road, at least at those speeds.
- Therefore, we can only logically conclude, that if Cecil Smith arrived at the accident site early, it was not early enough for Witness A to have seen him or his vehicle.

5 Reconciliation

5.1 Cecil Smith's Time Line Reconciles With Butch Atwood and Dick Guy's Time Line

- I have been able to reconstruct Cecil Smith and Butch Atwood's timeline, placing both of them at Butch Atwood's bus at about between 7:51:30

and 7:52.

- Therefore, we have a basis to believe that our reconstruction of both time lines are correct enough to approximate when various events took place for both of them.
- The key point in time is when Cecil Smith and Butch Atwood's time lines intersect, which is when Cecil Smith knocked on Butch Atwood's bus.
- The fact that Cecil Smith Arrived at Butch Atwood's bus at/about/between 7:51:30 and 7:52 is also supported by the fact that Cecil Smith said his conversation with Butch Atwood lasted "less than a minute" and the fact that Cecil Smith issued a "be on the lookout" at 7:54.
- Logically, Cecil Smith would only issue the "be on the lookout" after he became aware that the witnesses did not know where the driver was. Butch Atwood was the last witness Cecil Smith talked to.
- If it took 1 minute to issue a "be on the lookout," 2 minutes, 30 seconds to check for footprints on the side of the road and 30 seconds to 1 minute to return to the situs of the accident, the timeline reconciles with Dick Guy's statement in which he indicates that Cecil Smith was not at the situs of the Saturn when he arrived.